

Pre-K and Elementary Bilingual Instructional Programs (vs. English-based) for English Language Learners

Program description:

Bilingual instructional programs provide English language learner (ELL) students with instruction partially in their native language and partially in English. The evaluations included in this analysis compare programs that use bilingual instruction to those in which instruction is conducted entirely in English, such as English as a Second Language (ESL) or "sheltered" English. The results suggest that the language of instruction does not matter; there is no statistically significant difference in reading test scores between the two general types of programs.

Typical age of primary program participant: 6

Typical age of secondary program participant: N/A

Meta-Analysis of Program Effects

Outcomes Measured	Primary or Second-ary Participant	No. of Effect Sizes	Unadjusted Effect Sizes (Random Effects Model)			Adjusted Effect Sizes and Standard Errors Used in the Benefit-Cost Analysis					
						First time ES is estimated			Second time ES is estimated		
			ES	SE	p-value	ES	SE	Age	ES	SE	Age
Test scores	P	23	0.00	.01	0.9372	0.00	.01	7	0.00	.01	17

Benefits and costs were not estimated.

Multiplicative Adjustments Applied to the Meta-Analysis

Type of Adjustment	Multiplier
1- Less well-implemented comparison group or observational study, with some covariates.	0.5
2- Well-implemented comparison group design, often with many statistical controls.	0.5
3- Well-done observational study with many statistical controls (e.g., instrumental variables).	0.75
4- Random assignment, with some implementation issues.	0.75
5- Well-done random assignment study.	1.00
Program developer = researcher	0.5
Unusual (not "real-world") setting	0.5
Weak measurement used	0.5

Studies Used in the Meta-Analysis

- Alvarez, J. M. (1975). Comparison of academic aspirations and achievement in bilingual versus monolingual classrooms. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 36(02), 693A.
- Bacon, H. L., Kidd, G. D., & Seaberg, J. J. (1982). The effectiveness of bilingual instruction with Cherokee Indian students. *Journal of American Indian Education*, 21(2), 34-43.
- Barnett, W. S., Yarosz, D. J., Thomas, J., Jung, K., & Blanco, D. (2007). Two-way and monolingual English immersion in preschool education: An experimental comparison. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 22(3), 277-293.
- Caldero'n, M., Hertz-Lazarowitz, R., & Slavin, R. (1998). Effects of bilingual cooperative integrated reading and composition on students making the transition from Spanish to English reading. *The Elementary School Journal*, 99(2), 153-165.
- Carlisle, J. F., & Beeman, M. M. (2000). The effects of language of instruction on the reading and writing achievement of first-grade Hispanic children. *Scientific Studies of Reading*, 4(4), 331-353.
- Covey, D. D. (1973). An analytical study of secondary freshmen bilingual education and its effect on academic achievement and attitude of Mexican American students. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 33(09), 4789A.
- Danoff, M. N., Coles, G. J., McLaughlin, D. H., & Reynolds, D. J. (1978, January). *Evaluation of the impact of ESEA Title VII Spanish/English Bilingual Education Program. Volume III: Year two impact data, educational process, and in-depth analysis*. Palo Alto, CA: American Institutes for Research. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 154635)
- Duran, L. K., Roseth, C. J., & Hoffman, P. (2010). An experimental study comparing English-only and Transitional Bilingual Education on Spanish-speaking preschoolers' early literacy development. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, 25(2), 207-217.
- Elizondo de Weffer, R. C. (1973). Effects of first language instruction in academic and psychological development of bilingual children. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 33(11), 5991A.
- Farver, J. A. M., Lonigan, C. J., & Eppe, S. (2009). Effective early literacy skill development for young Spanish-speaking English language learners: An experimental study of two methods. *Child Development*, 80(3), 703-719.
- Huzar, H. (1973). *The effects of an English-Spanish primary-grade reading program on second- and third-grade students* (Master's thesis, Rutgers University). (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 085683)
- Jepsen, C. (2010). Bilingual education and English proficiency. *Education Finance and Policy*, 5(2), 200-227.

Studies Used in the Meta-Analysis

- Kaufman, M. (1968). Will instruction in reading Spanish affect ability in reading English? *Journal of Reading*, 11(7), 521-527.
- Lampman, H. P. (1973). *Southeastern New Mexico bilingual program: Final report*. Artesia, NM: Artesia Public Schools. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 081529)
- Layden, R. G. (1973). The relationship between the language of instruction and the development of self-concept, classroom climate, and achievement of Spanish speaking Puerto Rican children. *Dissertation Abstracts International*, 33(12), 6733A.
- Lopez, M. G., & Tashakkori, A. (2006). Differential outcomes of two bilingual education programs on English language learners. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 30(1), 123-145.
- Matsudaira, J. D. (2005, December). *Sinking or swimming? Evaluating the impact of English immersion versus bilingual education*. Berkeley: University of California, Berkeley; Robert Wood Johnson Scholars in Health Policy Program.
- Plante, A. J. (1976, January). *A study of the effectiveness of the Connecticut "Pairing" model of bilingual-bicultural education*. Hamden, CT: Connecticut Staff Development Cooperative. (ERIC Document Reproduction Service No. ED 125260)
- Ryan, A. M. (2007). Two tests of the effectiveness of bilingual education in preschool. *Journal of Research in Childhood Education*, 21(4), 352-363.
- Slavin, R. E., Madden, N., Calderon, M., Chamberlain, A., & Hennessy, M. (2010, January). *Reading and language outcomes of a five-year randomized evaluation of transitional bilingual education*. Unpublished manuscript. Retrieved June 16, 2011 from http://www.edweek.org/media/bilingual_pdf.pdf
- Tong, F., Irby, B., Lara-Alecio, R., & Mathes, P. (2008). English and Spanish acquisition by Hispanic second graders in developmental bilingual programs. *Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences*, 30(4), 500-529.